

"Wowchuk assertion preposterous."

In *Saskatchewan wants our power*, Manitoba Cooperator, Feb 24, Rosann Wowchuk, Minister Responsible for Manitoba Hydro, continues to mislead the citizens of Manitoba when she ties the possibility of export to Saskatchewan to her government's decision to force Manitoba Hydro to run the next transmission line (Bipole III) down the west side of the province.

Direct current (DC) transmission is used today almost exclusively for point-to-point transmission. Because of the higher resistance associated with the longer (by 54%) west-side line, such a line cannot match the transfer capability of a shorter east-side line. To imply that we can send a large block of power to Saskatchewan from a line that would be already heavily loaded would render Bipole III virtually useless as a reliable backup to the existing DC lines. For Minister Wowchuk to claim that a Bipole III west-side route can both provide a big block of power to Saskatchewan and, at the same time, be a reliable backup for the existing DC lines is preposterous. There are existing transmission ties with Saskatchewan for the sale of smaller blocks of power.

Should Minister Wowchuk insist on using a west-side Bipole III as a supply for Saskatchewan, conversion equipment would be needed at the Saskatchewan border. Conversion equipment has become very costly. Recently, we have learned that Bipole III costs have risen from \$2.2 billion to \$4.1 billion. A converter station at the border would cost in the vicinity of an additional \$1 billion, an extremely costly venture. It is hard to conceive how such a costly undertaking can leave any room for profit, especially when selling power to an energy-rich province like Saskatchewan which has huge resources of coal, oil and gas.

The Government of Manitoba needs to stop interfering with the business of Manitoba Hydro, and leave the power utility to choose the best route for Bipole III. Manitoba could then save a billion dollars by building Bipole III on the shorter, more economical and more reliable east side with its reduced socioeconomic impact, as recommended by the Bipole III Coalition (www.bipoleiiicoalition.ca).

*Will Tishinski, Vice-President, Power System Planning, Manitoba Hydro
(retired)*

*Garland Laliberte, Dean Emeritus, Faculty of Engineering, University of
Manitoba*